Convex duality in constrained mean-variance portfolio optimization under a regime-switching model

Catherine Donnelly¹ Andrew Heunis²

¹ETH Zurich, Switzerland

²University of Waterloo, Canada

26 June 2010

Catherine Donnelly, Andrew Heunis Convex duality in constrained portfolio optimization

イロト イポト イヨト イヨト



Investor

- Wishes to have \$100 in 1 year's time.
- Starts with \$90.
- Invests money in stockmarket and bank account.
- No short-selling.
- How to invest to minimize:

 $\mathbb{E}(\{\text{Investor's wealth in 1 year}\} - 100)^2$

subject to satisfying the investment restrictions and

 $\mathbb{E}(\{$ Investor's wealth in 1 year $\}) = 100$.

ヘロト ヘワト ヘビト ヘビト



Investor

- Wishes to have \$100 in 1 year's time.
- Starts with \$90.
- Invests money in stockmarket and bank account.
- No short-selling.
- How to invest to minimize:

 $\mathbb{E}(\{\text{Investor's wealth in 1 year}\} - 100)^2$

subject to satisfying the investment restrictions and

 $\mathbb{E}(\{\text{Investor's wealth in 1 year}\}) = 100.$

ヘロト 人間 ト ヘヨト ヘヨト











Catherine Donnelly, Andrew Heunis Convex duality in constrained portfolio optimization

★ E > ★ E >

э

Market model

- $(\Omega, \mathcal{F}, \mathbb{P})$ and finite time horizon [0, T].
- Market consists of *N* traded assets and a risk-free asset.
- Risk-free asset price process obeys

$$\frac{\mathrm{d}S_0(t)}{S_0(t)} = r(t)\,\mathrm{d}t.$$

Price processes of stocks obey

$$\frac{\mathrm{d}\boldsymbol{S}(t)}{\boldsymbol{S}(t)} = \mu(t)\,\mathrm{d}t + \sigma^{\top}(t)\,\mathrm{d}\boldsymbol{W}(t).$$

ヘロト 人間 ト ヘヨト ヘヨト

Market model

Market subject to regime-switching modeled by Markov chain $\boldsymbol{\alpha}.$

- Finite-state-space $I = \{1, \dots, D\}$.
- Generator matrix $G = (g_{ij})$.
- Jump processes for $i \neq j$

$$N_{ij}(t) = \sum_{0 < s \le t} \mathbf{1}[\alpha(s_{-}) = i]\mathbf{1}[\alpha(s) = j]$$

• Martingales for $i \neq j$

$$M_{ij}(t) = N_{ij}(t) - \int_0^t g_{ij} \mathbf{1}[\alpha(s_-) = i] \,\mathrm{d}s.$$

ヘロト ヘアト ヘビト ヘビト

-

Market model

Market subject to regime-switching modeled by Markov chain $\boldsymbol{\alpha}.$

- Finite-state-space $I = \{1, \ldots, D\}$.
- Generator matrix $G = (g_{ij})$.
- Jump processes for $i \neq j$

$$N_{ij}(t) = \sum_{0 < s \le t} \mathbf{1}[\alpha(s_{-}) = i]\mathbf{1}[\alpha(s) = j]$$

• Martingales for $i \neq j$

$$M_{ij}(t) = N_{ij}(t) - \int_0^t g_{ij} \mathbf{1}[\alpha(s_-) = i] \,\mathrm{d}s.$$

ヘロト ヘアト ヘビト ヘビト

÷.

The investor's wealth process

- Portfolio process $\pi(t) = \{\pi_1(t), \dots, \pi_N(t)\}$ at time *t*.
- Wealth process $X^{\pi}(t)$ at time t, given by

$$X^{\pi}(t) = \pi_0(t) + \sum_{n=1}^{N} \pi_n(t).$$

• Wealth equation: $X^{\pi}(0) = x_0$, a.s. and

 $\mathrm{d}X^{\pi}(t) = \left(r(t)X^{\pi}(t) + \pi^{\top}(t)\sigma(t)\theta(t)\right)\,\mathrm{d}t + \sigma^{\top}(t)\pi(t)\,\mathrm{d}W(t),$

where the market price of risk is

$$\theta(t) := \sigma^{-1}(t) \left(\mu(t) - r(t) \mathbf{1} \right).$$

イロト イポト イヨト イヨト

The investor's wealth process

- Portfolio process $\pi(t) = \{\pi_1(t), \dots, \pi_N(t)\}$ at time *t*.
- Wealth process $X^{\pi}(t)$ at time t, given by

$$X^{\pi}(t) = \pi_0(t) + \sum_{n=1}^{N} \pi_n(t).$$

• Wealth equation: $X^{\pi}(0) = x_0$, a.s. and

$$\mathrm{d} X^{\pi}(t) = \left(r(t) X^{\pi}(t) + \pi^{\top}(t) \sigma(t) \theta(t) \right) \, \mathrm{d} t + \sigma^{\top}(t) \pi(t) \, \mathrm{d} W(t),$$

where the market price of risk is

$$\theta(t) := \sigma^{-1}(t) \left(\mu(t) - r(t) \mathbf{1} \right).$$

イロト イポト イヨト イヨト

The investor's portfolio constraints

- $K \subset \mathbb{R}^N$ closed, convex set with $0 \in K$.
- Example: no short-selling

$$K:=\{\pi=(\pi_1,\ldots,\pi_N)\in\mathbb{R}^N:\pi_1\geq 0,\ldots,\pi_N\geq 0\}.$$

Set of admissible portfolios

$$\mathcal{A} := \{ \pi \in L^2(W) \, | \, \pi(t) \in K, \text{ a.e.} \}.$$

★ E → ★ E →

< 🗇 🕨

The investor's risk measure

Risk measure J

$$J(x) = rac{1}{2}Ax^2 + Bx + C, \quad \forall x \in \mathbb{R},$$

where A, B and C are random variables.

• Example:
$$J(x) = (x - 100)^2$$
.

イロト イポト イヨト イヨト

æ

The investor's problem

• Does there exist $\bar{\pi} \in \mathcal{A}$ such that

$$\mathbb{E}(J(X^{\bar{\pi}}(T))) = \inf_{\pi \in \mathcal{A}} \mathbb{E}(J(X^{\pi}(T)))?$$

Can we characterize $\bar{\pi}$? Can we find $\bar{\pi}$?

• Example:

$$\mathcal{A} := \{ \pi \in L^2(W) \, | \, \pi(t) \ge 0 \text{ a.e.} \}$$

and

$$\mathbb{E}(X^{\bar{\pi}}(T) - 100)^2 = \inf_{\pi \in A} \mathbb{E}(X^{\pi}(T) - 100)^2$$

ヘロト ヘワト ヘビト ヘビト

э

The investor's problem

• Does there exist $\bar{\pi} \in \mathcal{A}$ such that

$$\mathbb{E}(J(X^{\bar{\pi}}(T))) = \inf_{\pi \in \mathcal{A}} \mathbb{E}(J(X^{\pi}(T)))?$$

Can we characterize $\bar{\pi}$? Can we find $\bar{\pi}$?

• Example:

$$\mathcal{A} := \{ \pi \in L^2(W) \, | \, \pi(t) \geq 0 \text{ a.e.} \}$$

and

$$\mathbb{E}(X^{\bar{\pi}}(T) - 100)^2 = \inf_{\pi \in \mathcal{A}} \mathbb{E}(X^{\pi}(T) - 100)^2$$

Convex duality approach

- Restate MVO problem as primal problem.
- Construct dual problem.
- Necessary and sufficient conditions.
- Existence of a solution to the dual problem.
- Construct candidate primal solution.
- Verification.

(4) 臣() (4) 臣()

Convex duality approach

- Restate MVO problem as primal problem.
- Construct dual problem.
- Necessary and sufficient conditions.
- Existence of a solution to the dual problem.
- Construct candidate primal solution.
- Verification.

★ E ► ★ E ►

Restate MVO problem as primal problem

• Risk measure is minimized over portfolio processes.

 $\inf_{\pi\in\mathcal{A}}\mathbb{E}(J(X^{\pi}(T)))$

Move this minimization to one over a space of processes.

 $\inf_{X\in\mathbb{A}}\mathbb{E}(\Phi(X))$

- Key is the wealth equation.
- Wealth processes X^{π} embedded in space A.

イロト イポト イヨト イヨト

Restate MVO problem as primal problem

- Space A consists of square-integrable, continuous processes.
- If $X \in \mathbb{A}$ then a.s. $X(0) = X_0$ and

$$\mathrm{d}X(t) = \Upsilon^X(t)\,\mathrm{d}t + \left(\Lambda^X\right)^\top(t)\,\mathrm{d}W(t).$$

ヘロト 人間 ト ヘヨト ヘヨト

Restate MVO problem as primal problem

- Encode constraints as penalty functions l_0 , l_1 .
- The initial wealth requirement $X(0) = x_0$ motivates

$$I_0(x) := \begin{cases} 0 & \text{if } x = x_0 \\ \infty & \text{otherwise,} \end{cases}$$

for all $x \in \mathbb{R}$.

• The wealth equation and portfolio constraints motivate:

 $l_1(\omega, t, x, \nu, \lambda) := \begin{cases} 0 & \text{if } \nu = r(\omega, t)x + \lambda^\top \theta(\omega, t) \\ & \text{and } (\sigma^\top(\omega, t))^{-1}\lambda \in K \\ \infty & \text{otherwise,} \end{cases}$

for all $(\omega, t, x, \nu, \lambda) \in \Omega \times [0, T] \times \mathbb{R} \times \mathbb{R} \times \mathbb{R}^N$.

Restate MVO problem as primal problem

- Encode constraints as penalty functions l_0 , l_1 .
- The initial wealth requirement $X(0) = x_0$ motivates

$$l_0(x) := \begin{cases} 0 & \text{if } x = x_0 \\ \infty & \text{otherwise,} \end{cases}$$

for all $x \in \mathbb{R}$.

• The wealth equation and portfolio constraints motivate:

 $l_1(\omega, t, x, \nu, \lambda) := \begin{cases} 0 & \text{if } \nu = r(\omega, t)x + \lambda^\top \theta(\omega, t) \\ & \text{and } (\sigma^\top(\omega, t))^{-1}\lambda \in K \\ \infty & \text{otherwise,} \end{cases}$

for all $(\omega, t, x, \nu, \lambda) \in \Omega \times [0, T] \times \mathbb{R} \times \mathbb{R} \times \mathbb{R}^N$.

Restate MVO problem as primal problem

- Encode constraints as penalty functions I_0 , I_1 .
- The initial wealth requirement $X(0) = x_0$ motivates

$$l_0(x) := \begin{cases} 0 & \text{if } x = x_0 \\ \infty & \text{otherwise,} \end{cases}$$

for all $x \in \mathbb{R}$.

• The wealth equation and portfolio constraints motivate:

$$l_1(\omega, t, x, \nu, \lambda) := \begin{cases} 0 & \text{if } \nu = r(\omega, t)x + \lambda^\top \theta(\omega, t) \\ & \text{and } (\sigma^\top(\omega, t))^{-1}\lambda \in K \\ \infty & \text{otherwise,} \end{cases}$$

for all $(\omega, t, x, \nu, \lambda) \in \Omega \times [0, T] \times \mathbb{R} \times \mathbb{R} \times \mathbb{R}^N$.

Restate MVO problem as primal problem

• Primal cost functional $\Phi : \mathbb{A} \to \mathbb{R} \cup \{\infty\}$,

$$\Phi(X) := I_0(X_0) + \mathbb{E} \int_0^T I_1(t, X(t), \Upsilon^X(t), \Lambda^X(t)) \, \mathrm{d}t + \mathbb{E}(J(X(T))).$$

• Primal problem: find $\bar{X} \in \mathbb{A}$ such that

$$\Phi(\bar{X}) = \inf_{X \in \mathbb{A}} \Phi(X).$$

• Use wealth equation to recover $\bar{\pi}$.

イロト イポト イヨト イヨト

Restate MVO problem as primal problem

• Primal cost functional $\Phi : \mathbb{A} \to \mathbb{R} \cup \{\infty\}$,

$$\Phi(X) := I_0(X_0) + \mathbb{E} \int_0^T I_1(t, X(t), \Upsilon^X(t), \Lambda^X(t)) \, \mathrm{d}t + \mathbb{E}(J(X(T))).$$

• Primal problem: find $\bar{X} \in \mathbb{A}$ such that

$$\Phi(\bar{X}) = \inf_{X \in \mathbb{A}} \Phi(X).$$

• Use wealth equation to recover $\bar{\pi}$.

→ E → < E →</p>

< 🗇 🕨

Convex duality approach

- Restate MVO problem as primal problem.
- Construct dual problem.
- Necessary and sufficient conditions.
- Existence of a solution to the dual problem.
- Construct candidate primal solution.
- Verification.

★ E → ★ E →

Construct dual problem

- Look for solutions to dual problem in the space \mathbb{B} .
- Space B consists of square-integrable, right-continuous processes.
- If $Y \in \mathbb{B}$ then a.s. $Y(0) = Y_0$ and

$$\mathrm{d}Y(t) = \Upsilon^{Y}(t)\,\mathrm{d}t + \left(\Lambda^{Y}\right)^{\top}(t)\,\mathrm{d}W(t) + \sum_{i\neq j}\Gamma^{Y}_{ij}(t)\,\mathrm{d}M_{ij}(t).$$

ヘロト 人間 ト ヘヨト ヘヨト

Construct dual problem

• Take convex conjugates of I_0 , I_1 and J.

$$m_0(y) := \sup_{x \in \mathbb{R}} \{xy - l_0(x)\}, \quad \forall y \in \mathbb{R}.$$

• Dual cost functional $\Psi : \mathbb{B} \to \mathbb{R} \cup \{\infty\},\$

$$\Psi(Y) := m_0(Y_0) + \mathbb{E} \int_0^T m_1(t, Y(t), \Upsilon^Y(t), \Lambda^Y(t)) dt + \mathbb{E}(m_J(-Y(T))).$$

• Dual problem: find $\overline{Y} \in \mathbb{B}$ such that

$$\Psi(\bar{Y}) = \inf_{Y \in \mathbb{B}} \Psi(Y).$$

イロト イポト イヨト イヨト

э

Construct dual problem

• Take convex conjugates of I_0 , I_1 and J.

$$m_0(y) := \sup_{x \in \mathbb{R}} \{xy - l_0(x)\}, \quad \forall y \in \mathbb{R}.$$

• Dual cost functional $\Psi : \mathbb{B} \to \mathbb{R} \cup \{\infty\},\$

$$\Psi(Y) := m_0(Y_0) + \mathbb{E} \int_0^T m_1(t, Y(t), \Upsilon^Y(t), \Lambda^Y(t)) dt + \mathbb{E}(m_J(-Y(T))).$$

• Dual problem: find $\overline{Y} \in \mathbb{B}$ such that

$$\Psi(\bar{Y}) = \inf_{Y \in \mathbb{B}} \Psi(Y).$$

ヘロト 人間 ト ヘヨト ヘヨト

Construct dual problem

• Take convex conjugates of I_0 , I_1 and J.

$$m_0(y) := \sup_{x \in \mathbb{R}} \{xy - l_0(x)\}, \quad \forall y \in \mathbb{R}.$$

• Dual cost functional $\Psi : \mathbb{B} \to \mathbb{R} \cup \{\infty\},\$

$$\Psi(Y) := m_0(Y_0) + \mathbb{E} \int_0^T m_1(t, Y(t), \Upsilon^Y(t), \Lambda^Y(t)) dt + \mathbb{E}(m_J(-Y(T))).$$

• Dual problem: find $\overline{Y} \in \mathbb{B}$ such that

$$\Psi(\bar{Y}) = \inf_{Y \in \mathbb{B}} \Psi(Y).$$

ヘロト 人間 ト ヘヨト ヘヨト

Convex duality approach

- Restate MVO problem as primal problem.
- Construct dual problem.
- Necessary and sufficient conditions.
- Existence of a solution to the dual problem.
- Construct candidate primal solution.
- Verification.

★ E → ★ E →

Necessary and sufficient conditions

For $(\bar{X}, \bar{Y}) \in \mathbb{A} imes \mathbb{B}$,

 $ar{X} \in \mathbb{A}$ solves the primal problem and $ar{Y} \in \mathbb{B}$ solves the dual problem

if and only if

 $(ar{X},ar{Y})\in\mathbb{A} imes\mathbb{B}$ satisfy necessary and sufficient conditions, eg

$$\bar{X}(T) = -\frac{\bar{Y}(T) + B}{A}$$
, a.s.,
 $\Upsilon^{\bar{Y}}(t) = -r(t)\bar{Y}(t)$, a.e.

・ 同 ト ・ ヨ ト ・ ヨ ト …

Convex duality approach

- Restate MVO problem as primal problem.
- Construct dual problem.
- Necessary and sufficient conditions.
- Existence of a solution to the dual problem.
- Construct candidate primal solution.
- Verification.

★ E ► ★ E ►

Existence of a solution to the dual problem

• There exists $\bar{Y} \in \mathbb{B}$ such that

$$\Psi(\bar{Y}) = \inf_{Y \in \mathbb{B}} \Psi(Y).$$

Catherine Donnelly, Andrew Heunis Convex duality in constrained portfolio optimization

э

Convex duality approach

- Restate MVO problem as primal problem.
- Construct dual problem.
- Necessary and sufficient conditions.
- Existence of a solution to the dual problem.
- Construct candidate primal solution.
- Verification.

★ E ► ★ E ►

Construct candidate primal solution

State price density process

$$H(t) = \exp\{-\int_0^t r(s) \,\mathrm{d}s\}\mathcal{E}(-\theta \bullet W)(t)$$

• $X^{\pi}(t)H(t) = \mathbb{E}(X^{\pi}(T)H(T) | \mathcal{F}_t)$

• From necessary and sufficient conditions,

$$\bar{X}(T) = -\frac{\bar{Y}(T) + B}{A}.$$

• Candidate primal solution $\tilde{X} \in \mathbb{B}$

$$\tilde{X}(t) := -\frac{1}{H(t)} \mathbb{E}\left(\left(\frac{\bar{Y}(T) + B}{A}\right) H(T) \,\middle|\, \mathcal{F}_t\right)$$

イロト イポト イヨト イヨト

Construct candidate primal solution

State price density process

$$H(t) = \exp\{-\int_0^t r(s) \,\mathrm{d}s\}\mathcal{E}(-\theta \bullet W)(t)$$

- $X^{\pi}(t)H(t) = \mathbb{E}(X^{\pi}(T)H(T) | \mathcal{F}_t)$
- From necessary and sufficient conditions,

$$\bar{X}(T) = -\frac{\bar{Y}(T) + B}{A}$$

• Candidate primal solution $\tilde{X} \in \mathbb{B}$

$$\tilde{X}(t) := -\frac{1}{H(t)} \mathbb{E}\left(\left(\frac{\bar{Y}(T) + B}{A}\right) H(T) \,\middle|\, \mathcal{F}_t\right)$$

Convex duality in constrained portfolio optimization

(4回) (1日) (日)

Construct candidate primal solution

State price density process

$$H(t) = \exp\{-\int_0^t r(s) \,\mathrm{d}s\}\mathcal{E}(-\theta \bullet W)(t)$$

- $X^{\pi}(t)H(t) = \mathbb{E}(X^{\pi}(T)H(T) | \mathcal{F}_t)$
- From necessary and sufficient conditions,

$$\bar{X}(T) = -\frac{\bar{Y}(T) + B}{A}$$

• Candidate primal solution $\tilde{X} \in \mathbb{B}$

$$ilde{X}(t) := -rac{1}{H(t)} \mathbb{E}\left(\left(rac{ar{Y}(T) + B}{A}\right) H(T) \middle| \mathcal{F}_t\right).$$

ъ

Convex duality approach

- Restate MVO problem as primal problem.
- Construct dual problem.
- Necessary and sufficient conditions.
- Existence of a solution to the dual problem.
- Construct candidate primal solution.
- Verification.

(4) 臣() (4) 臣()



• Market parameters $\{\mathcal{F}_t^{\alpha}\}$ -previsible.

•
$$J(x) = (x - d)^2$$
, some $d \in \mathbb{R}$.

• Use necessary and sufficient conditions.

イロト イポト イヨト イヨト

No portfolio constraints

 $K := \mathbb{R}^N$

$$ar{\pi}(t) = -\left(X^{ar{\pi}}(t) - \mathcal{d}rac{R(t)}{S(t)}
ight)\left(\sigma^{ op}(t)
ight)^{-1} heta(t),$$

for

$$\begin{split} \boldsymbol{R}(t) &= \mathbb{E}\left[\exp\left\{\int_{t}^{T}\left(\boldsymbol{r}(\boldsymbol{u}) - \|\boldsymbol{\theta}(\boldsymbol{u})\|^{2}\right) \,\mathrm{d}\boldsymbol{u}\right\} \, \left|\boldsymbol{\alpha}(t)\right],\\ \boldsymbol{S}(t) &= \mathbb{E}\left[\exp\left\{\int_{t}^{T}\left(2\boldsymbol{r}(\boldsymbol{u}) - \|\boldsymbol{\theta}(\boldsymbol{u})\|^{2}\right) \,\mathrm{d}\boldsymbol{u}\right\} \, \left|\boldsymbol{\alpha}(t)\right]. \end{split}$$

イロン イロン イヨン イヨン

ъ

Restricted investment portfolio constraints

Example:
$$K = \{\pi = (\pi_1, ..., \pi_N) \in \mathbb{R}^N : \pi_1 = 0, ..., \pi_M = 0\}.$$

$$\bar{\pi}(t) = -\left(X^{\bar{\pi}}(t) - d\frac{R(t)}{S(t)}\right) \left(\sigma^{\top}(t)\right)^{-1} \xi(t),$$

for

$$\begin{split} \xi(t) &= \theta(t) - \operatorname{proj} \left[\theta(t) \left| \sigma^{-1}(t) \tilde{K} \right], \\ R(t) &= \mathbb{E} \left[\exp \left\{ \int_{t}^{T} \left(r(u) - \theta^{\top}(u)\xi(u) \right) \, \mathrm{d}u \right\} \left| \alpha(t) \right], \\ S(t) &= \mathbb{E} \left[\exp \left\{ \int_{t}^{T} \left(2r(u) - \theta^{\top}(u)\xi(u) \right) \, \mathrm{d}u \right\} \left| \alpha(t) \right] \right] \end{split}$$

ヘロト ヘワト ヘビト ヘビト

э

Convex conic portfolio constraints

K closed convex cone containing the origin.

Further assume: *r* deterministic and $x_0 \leq d \exp\{-\int_0^T r(u) du\}$.

$$\bar{\pi}(t) = -\left(X^{\bar{\pi}}(t) - d\exp\{-\int_t^T r(u) \,\mathrm{d}u\}\right) \left(\sigma^{\top}(t)\right)^{-1} \xi(t),$$

for

$$\xi(t) = heta(t) - \operatorname{proj}\left[heta(t) \left| \sigma^{-1}(t) ilde{K}
ight]$$

・ 同 ト ・ ヨ ト ・ ヨ ト



Showed existence and characterized the solution for MVO problem with

- general convex portfolio constraints; and
- random market coefficients

in a regime-switching model.

Solutions in feedback form.

★ E → < E →</p>

Convex duality in constrained mean-variance portfolio optimization under a regime-switching model

Catherine Donnelly¹ Andrew Heunis²

¹ETH Zurich, Switzerland

²University of Waterloo, Canada

26 June 2010

Catherine Donnelly, Andrew Heunis Convex duality in constrained portfolio optimization

A B + A B +
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A
 A

→ E → < E →</p>